

New York Matrimonial Trial Handbook 2023 Cumulative Update

Table Of Contents

By Joel R. Brandes

of the New York Bar

B.A. Queens College of the City University of New York; J.D. Brooklyn Law School; LLM, New York University, School of Law

Chapter 1 Preliminary Matters, Conduct of Trial and Rules of Evidence	11
1-4. The Attorneys - The Attorney for the Child	11
1-14. New Rules Governing Matrimonial Actions	12
1-14.10 Preliminary Conference - Stipulation as to Issues - 22 NYCRR 202.16 (f), 22 NYCRR 202.11	13
1-14.30 Settlement and Pre-trial Conference - 22 NYCRR §202.26.	14
1-14.60 Settlement Conference Before a Justice Other than the Justice Assigned to the Case.- 22 NYCRR §202.29.	15
1-14.90 Statement of Proposed Disposition - 22 NYCRR 202.16(h).	15
1-15. Pre-trial Submission of Witness List - 22 NYCRR 202.16 (g) (6)	16
1-15.10 Scheduling Witnesses - 22 NYCRR 202.37.	17
1-15.50 Pre-Trial Memoranda, Exhibit Book and Requests for Jury Instructions - 22 NYCRR 202.20-h..	18
1-15.70 Premarking Exhibits, Memoranda, Exhibit Books - 22 NYCRR 202.16 (m), 22 NYCRR 202.34	18
1-16. Pre-trial Disclosure of Expert Witnesses - “Expert Witnesses and Other Trial Matters” - 22 NYCRR 202.16 (g)	19
1-17.40 Disclosure of films, photographs, video tapes or audio tapes - CPLR 3101(i)	22
1-18. Preclusion of Fact Witness Testimony At Trial for Failure to Comply with Pre-trial Discovery Request Unavailable - CPLR 3126	25
1-18.40 Preclusion of Fact Witness or Evidence For Violation of Order To Submit Pre-Trial Witness List And Exhibit List	28

1-18.80 Preclusion for Failure to Produce - 22 NYCRR 202.16 (f) (1-b) (5)	28
1-19.30 Direct testimony of Party's Witness by Affidavit - 22 NYCRR 202.16 (n)	30
1-19.60 Direct Testimony by Affidavit – 22 NYCRR 202.20-I	32
1-19.90 Direct testimony by Experts Report – 22 NYCRR 202.16(g)	33
1-29. Method of Compliance with Trial Subpoenas	33
1-32. Trial Subpoenas - Motion to quash, fix conditions or modify a Subpoena - Defenses to Contempt Application	33
Chapter 2 Rules of Evidence Particularly Applicable to Matrimonial and Family Court Proceedings	35
2-3. Admissibility of Evidence - General Rule	35
2-10 Fundamental and Harmless Error	35
2-10.10. Foundation for Evidence - Res Judicata	38
2-10.20. Foundation for Evidence - Collateral Estoppel	39
2-10.30. Foundation for Evidence - On the Merits and Without Prejudice	41
2-14. Foundation for Evidence - Rule Against Inconsistent Positions	41
2-16. Foundation for Evidence - Judicial Notice of Law and Facts	42
2-28. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule against Hearsay - Evidence of Abuse or Neglect in Custody and Child Protective Proceedings	42
2-28.50 Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule against Hearsay – CPLR 4549 – Admissibility of an opposing party's statement	43
2-55.50. Admissibility of Evidence - Consumer of legal services and a legal or lawyer referral service privilege - Judiciary Law §498	43
2-60.10 Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Rape crisis counselor - client privilege - Civil Practice Law and Rules § 4510 .	44
2-64. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Adverse Inference from Failure of Party to Testify and Failure to Call Favorable Witness - Missing Witness Rule in Civil Case	45
2-70.40. Admissibility of Evidence – Authentication	45
2-70.60. Rebuttable presumption of authenticity of material produced pursuant to Article 31 demand – CPLR 4540-a	45

2-74. Admissibility of Evidence - Authentication of Text Message and Questions for Introduction into Evidence	47
2-77. Admissibility of Evidence - Authentication of email and Questions for Introduction	50
2-81.50. Questions for Laying Foundation for Admission of Photograph into Evidence	52
2-81.70. Questions for Laying Foundation for Admission of Photograph into Evidence by Photographers' Testimony	53
2-97. Practice Point - Difference Between General Objection to Offer in Evidence and Specific Objection	54
Chapter 3 Conduct of Trial	55
3-2. Opening and Closing Statements - When and how to make them	55
3-38. Right of Trial Judge to Call own witness	56
3-48. Cross- Examination - Impeachment of Witness by Prior Inconsistent Statement and Questions for Introduction	57
3-68. Trial Testimony - Prior Testimony - Admission of Prior Testimony	58
3-74. Duty of court to determine equitable distribution, maintenance, child support and custody	58
3-75. Motion to Reopen trial	60
3-76. Motion for Reconstruction of trial record	62
Chapter 4 Agreements and Stipulations of Settlement during Trial	63
4-1.10. Requirement of Acknowledged Agreement in Matrimonial Actions	63
Chapter 6 Grounds for Divorce and Defenses	66
6-14. Proof of Adultery - By Circumstantial Evidence	66
Chapter 15. Maintenance	66
15-4. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards – Actions Commenced Between October 12, 2010, and January 22, 2016 - The Twenty Factors	66
Chapter 18 Examination of Employer	67
18-10. Direct Examination of Employee Benefits and Executive Compensation Evaluator (Restricted Stock units, Preferred Stock units, deferred compensation, severance plan)	67
Chapter 19 Child Support and Support of Adult Dependent	73

**19-2.10. The Basic Child Support Obligation - Presumed to meet basic needs
73**

**19-11. Add-ons - Child Care - Domestic Relations Law §240(1-b) (c) (4) and
Domestic Relations Law §240(1-b) (c) (6). 73**

**19-14. Child Support - Determining How Much Income to Apply Statutory
Percentage to Where Combined Parental Income is in Excess of the Statutory
income cap 74**

**19-18. Support orders for Adult Dependents - Domestic Relations Law §240-d
74**

Chapter 23 Counsel Fee Awards 77

**23-4.50. Counsel Fee awards – Presumption in favor of counsel fees to less
monied spouse – Determining who is monied spouse 77**

23-5. Counsel Fee Awards - Right to a Hearing 79

**23-9. Stipulation to have the issue of counsel fees determined on affirmations
79**

23-10. Requirement of affidavits from Experts 80

23-11. Requirement of affidavits from prior attorneys 80

23-12. Conduct in litigation, obstruction and delaying tactics. 81

23-13. Hourly rates requested must be reasonable 91

23-14. Court is expert on value of legal services 92

23-15 Contingency Fees Barred in Matrimonial Action 92

Chapter 25 Property Distribution 94

25-1.5 Marital Property after Discontinuance of Prior Action 94

**25-6. Separate Property - Property Acquired Before Marriage or By Inheritance or
gift 94**

**25-13.50 Property Distribution – Allocation of Marital Assets and Marital Debts –
Contingent Distribution 96**

**25-14. Property Distribution - Appreciation of Separate Property - Burden of Proof
- Direct and Indirect Contributions 96**

**25-17.50. Property Distribution - Separate Property Becomes Marital Property -
Transmutation and Commingling 97**

25-21.20. Property Distribution - Retirement Benefits, Severance Payments, Stock Plans, Bonuses and Deferred Compensation - Deferred Compensation	102
25-21.30. Property Distribution - Retirement Benefits, Severance Payments, Stock Plans, Bonuses and Deferred Compensation - Severance payments	102
25-21.40. Property Distribution - Retirement Benefits, Severance Payments, Stock Plans, Bonuses and Deferred Compensation - Early Retirement Incentive Payments	104
25-21.50 Property Distribution - Effect of Post Judgment Events Upon Spouses share of Retirement Benefits	106
25-21.60. Property Distribution - Restricted stock and stock option benefit plans	106
25-34. Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d) - The Sixteen Factors - Factor (12) - Wasteful dissipation of assets by either spouse	109
25-35. Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d) - The Sixteen Factors - Factor (13) - Transfer or encumbrance made in contemplation of a matrimonial action	122
25-36. Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d) - The Sixteen Factors - Factor (14) - Acts of Domestic Violence	126
25-37. Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d) - The Sixteen Factors - Factor 15 - Best Interest of Companion Animals	127
25-38. Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d) - The Sixteen Factors - Factor Sixteen - Any other factor which the court shall expressly find to be just and proper	130
Chapter 27. Valuation Methodology	131
27-1. Valuation Methodology – Generally	131
Chapter 33. Methodology of Real-Estate Valuation	132
33-1. Market Value	132
Chapter 37 Custody Jurisdiction	132
37-7. Blind Persons Right to Parent - Domestic Relations Law § 75-m	132
Chapter 38 Custody Litigation	134
38-28 Custody Proceedings – Evidence - In-camera and Lincoln interviews	134
38-28.10 Custody Proceedings – Evidence - In-camera and Lincoln interviews - Duty to Check Accuracy	134
Chapter 44 Preserving the Right to Appeal	135

44-1. In General	135
44-2. Failure to appeal an issue	135
44-3. Acceptance of benefits	135
44-4. Failure to preserve Issues by failing to request or object to Relief	136
44-5. Participation in proceedings without objecting	137
44-6. Issues which could have been raised on prior Appeal	138
44-7. Issues or Arguments raised for the first time in reply or reply brief	139
44-8. Failure to address issues in brief	139
44-9. Failure to provide an adequate record	139
Chapter 45 Virtual Bench Trials	140
45-1 Authority for Virtual Bench Trials	140
45-2 Virtual Bench Trial Protocols and Procedures	141
45-3 Overview	141
45-4 Virtual Bench Trial Decorum	142
45-6 Maintaining Public Access	143
45-7 Pre-Trial Considerations	144
45-8 Virtual Pre-Trial Conference	144
45-9 Opening Statements	145
45-10 Exhibits	146
45-11 Witness Testimony	147
45-12 Sidebar Conferences	149
45-13 Closing Arguments	149
45-14 Record on Appeal	149
45-15 Virtual Criminal Bench Trial Considerations	150
45-16 Summary	152
EXHIBIT A - Proposed Stipulation And Order For Virtual Bench Trial Protocols And Procedures	152
EXHIBIT B - Sample Witness Inquiry	164
EXHIBIT C - Sample Defendant Waiver Of In- Person Bench Trial Form	165

Defendant(s) 165

Chapter 46. Frequently Asked Questions about Trials and Hearings 169

Question: (Effect of document in evidence without testimony) 169

Question: (Effect of my adversary putting document in evidence without testimony) I am concerned that my adversary put a lot of documents in evidence, without eliciting any testimony from his client. How does that work? Is the Court expected to review tens of thousand of pages without testimony? Is there any motion I can make to strike all the documents that weren't supported by testimony? 169

Question: (What is voir dire) What is voir dire and how does it work when my adversary attempts to introduce an exhibit in evidence? 170

Question: (Redirect of expert) Am I required to do ask Re-direct questions for the experts? 170

Question: (Questions about expert witnesses report) I have questions prepared to ask my expert witness when he testifies which refer to his report. What if the Court doesn't admit his report in evidence? Can he still refer to that report? 170

Question: (Expert testimony about methodology used) I want to ask my expert how he interprets the DeJesus case which established the methodology that he followed in doing his evaluation of the husband's retirement benefits. My expert is not a lawyer. I am concerned that the Court may sustain an objection to such a question. What is the best way to approach his direct examination? 170

Question: (Court curtailing my cross examination) The Judge is running out of patience and keeps on telling me that he will curtail my cross examination because I am not addressing relevant aspects of the case. What do I do? 171

Question: (Answers to my questions not responsive) When the plaintiff responds to a question propounded by me he frequently does not answer my question but rambles on with extraneous matter that is on his agenda which has nothing to do with the question he was asked. What can I do to stop this and get him to answer my question? 171

Question: (Instruction by Judge to move on) When I ask a question and the Judge sustains an objection to it, and I rephrase it, and the Judge sustains another objection, the court often tells me to "move on". Does this mean that I can not elicit the testimony I was hoping to elicit? 171

Question: (Secondary Evidence) What is "secondary evidence" and can you give me a sample of how you lay a foundation for it? I thought secondary evidence is about offering copies of original documents that are lost or difficult to locate?

172

Question: (Admission of evidence by proffer) What do I tell the Judge when she asks me for a “proffer” or offer of proof? 172

Question: (Exhibits marked as “ID Only). The Judge asked counsel to pre-mark exhibits. So, before the trial starts, on any given date, we begin by handing the pre-marked exhibits to the Judge and my adversary. After that, the Judge asks my adversary to either stipulate to put the exhibits in evidence, or “reserve”; if my adversary “reserves”, then the exhibit is marked for ID Only. What happens with the ID only exhibits? How do I get them moved in evidence? There are about 12 documents that my adversary objected to and therefore did not go into evidence, but were marked as “ID Only” This happened either because the Judge sustained my adversary’s objection or because I simply missed asking to mark them into evidence. Do I get a second bite? Am I allowed to go back and try to put these documents in evidence?173

Question: (Pressure to end Direct Examination.) The Judge is pressuring me, when we are in Chambers, to end the direct examination of my client before I am ready to do so. He expects me to finish tomorrow, and I’m not sure if I can finish on time. What should I do? 174

Question: (Proper way to refute adverse party testimony.) What is the proper way to offer testimony of my client refuting testimony of her spouse? 174

Question: (Late retention of expert witness) I want to offer the testimony of an expert witness as to the value the marital residence. I am engaged in the trial and the judge has indicated that he will not let me call an expert witness at this late date because I did not comply with CPLR 3101(d). What do I do? 174

Question: (Admissibility of net worth affidavit.) Is the net worth affidavit required by Domestic Relations Law §236(B)(4) admissible in evidence over objection?” 175

Question: (Offering new exhibits after resting). Can you let me know what you think about my adversary's attempt to put new exhibits in evidence after the plaintiff rested? 176

Question: (New Exhibits during Cross Examination.) My adversary rested on her prima facie case. When my adversary cross-examines my client tomorrow, is she permitted to offer new exhibits in evidence? She has already provided me with additional new exhibits which she intends to offer in evidence. Can she do so? I though she couldn't do it after she rested. 176

Question: (Scope of Re-direct and Re-cross Examination.) After my clients cross-examination is completed I have the right to do "re-direct" examination. I am not sure how to do it. Am I limited by the questions and testimony elicited on cross-examination? 177

Question: (Scope of Rebuttal and sur-rebuttal testimony). My adversary told the judge that she does not intend to have "Rebuttal". What does rebuttal mean? If the plaintiff doesn't have rebuttal, is the defendant permitted to do it?177

Question: (Documents admitted for demonstrative purposes). The Court has admitted documents my adversary offered into evidence for demonstrative purposes. What does that mean? 178

Appendix A - Domestic Relations Law § 236, October 25, 2021 179

Appendix B - Domestic Relations Law § 240, November 11, 2020 211