

New York Matrimonial Trial Handbook

Table of Contents

By Joel R. Brandes

of the New York Bar

B.A. Queens College of the City University of New York; J.D. Brooklyn Law School; LLM, New York University, School of Law

Part 1 Preliminary Matters Prior to the Commencement of Trial, Conduct of Trial and Rules of Evidence Particularly Applicable in Matrimonial Matters 1

Chapter 1. Preliminary Matters, Conduct of Trial and Rules of Evidence	1
1-1. The Parties - Client's Right to Settle the Case and Participation by Trial Judge in Settlement Discussions	1
1-2. The Parties - Pro Se Litigants	3
1-3. The Attorneys - Acts of Attorney during Trial Are Binding upon Client	4
1-4. The Attorneys - The Attorney for the Child	4
1-5. The Attorneys - Conflicting Engagements of Counsel	7
1-6. The Attorneys - Effect of Appearance by Counsel	8
1-7. The Attorneys - Lawyer as Witness	9
1-8. The Court - Ex-parte Communications By Counsel and Court Prohibited	10
1-9. The Court - Recusal	12
1-10. The Pleadings - In General	13
1-11. The Pleadings - The Purpose of Pleadings.	13
1-12. The Pleadings - Use During Trial and Inconsistent, Alternative and Hypothetical Causes of Action.	14
1-13. The Pleadings - Marked Pleadings	15
1-14. Limitations - Preliminary Conference Stipulation as to Issues	15
1-15. Limitations - Pre-trial Submission of Witness List and Exhibit List	16
1-17. Limitations - Pre-trial Disclosure of Expert Witnesses - Reports - Court - Appointed Witnesses. – CPLR 3101(d) - Photographs, Videos, and Recordings	17
1-18. Limitations - Preclusion of Expert Testimony at Trial for Failure to Comply with CPLR 3101(d)	19
1-19. Limitations - Preclusion of Fact Witness Testimony At Trial for Failure to Comply with Pre-trial Discovery Request Unavailable - CPLR 3126	21

1-20. Limitations - In Limine Motions	24
1-21. Trial Subpoenas - Necessity for Subpoena	27
1-22. Trial Subpoenas - Service of Trial Subpoena on Party	28
1-23. Trial Subpoenas - Service on Non-Party Witness and Party – Not a disclosure order	28
1-24. Trial Subpoenas - Non-Party Witness and Travel Fees - Excessive Compensation of Fact Witnesses	31
1-25. Trial Subpoenas - Advance Service upon Hospital, Municipal Corporation or State for Patient Records	33
1-26. Trial Subpoenas - HIPPA Requirements	33
1-27. Trial Subpoenas - Motion For Subpoena for Library or Municipality - CPLR 2307	38
1-28. Trial Subpoenas - Place of Production of Documents and Inspection	38
1-29. Trial Subpoenas - Method of Compliance with Trial Subpoenas	39
1-30. Trial Subpoenas - Remedies for Failure to Comply - Contempt	40
1-31. Trial Subpoenas - Remedies for failure to Comply - Warrant for Arrest	41
1-32. Trial Subpoenas - Motion to quash, fix conditions or modify a Subpoena - Defenses to Contempt Application	42
1-33. Trial Subpoenas - Practice Points	45
1-34. Trial - At Place Other than courthouse	47
1-35. Trial - Duration of trial	47
1-36. Trial - Reference to Referee	47
1-37. Trial - Reference to Referee - Review by Supreme Court of Referee’s Jurisdiction	50
1-38. Trial - Payment for Transcript of Trial - Payment for Transcript of Trial - Trial Before Court and Before Referee to Hear and Report.	50
1-39. Trial - Motion to Reopen Case During and After Trial	52
1-40. Trial - Amendment of Pleadings Permissible During Trial	52
1-41. Trial - Motion to Amend Pleadings to Conform to the Proof	53
1-42. Trial - Method of Making Motion to Amend Pleadings to Conform to the Proof	53
1-43. Trial - Motion for judgment during trial - CPLR 4401	53
1-44. Trial - Motion for a Mistrial or Continuance during the Trail - CPLR 4402	54
1-45 Trial. - Requests for findings	55
1-46. Trial - Form of decision	55
1-47. Trial - Time for decision	2
2. Rules of Evidence Particularly Applicable to Matrimonial and Family Court Proceedings	1

2-1. Rules of Evidence - In General	1
2-2. Evidence and Proof - Competent and Material	1
2-3. Admissibility of Evidence - General Rule	2
2-4. Burden of Proof - Standards of Proof	2
2-5. Burden of Proof - Fair Preponderance of Credible Evidence - Clear and Convincing Evidence	3
2-6. Burden of Proof - Clear and Convincing Evidence in Matrimonial Actions	6
2-7. Burden of Proof - Presumptions	6
2-8. Standards of Proof for Overcoming Presumptions in Matrimonial Actions	8
2-9. Burden of Proof - “Competent Proof” in Family Court Proceedings	9
2-10. Foundation for Evidence - Fundamental Error and Harmless Error	9
2-11. Foundation for Evidence - Stare Decisis - The Doctrine of Precedent	11
2-12. Foundation for Evidence - Law of the Case	14
2-13. Foundation for Evidence - Judicial Estoppel	16
2-14. Foundation for Evidence - Rule Against Inconsistent Positions	16
2-15. Foundation for Evidence - Estoppel from Presenting Evidence at Trial Based Upon Contents of Response to Discovery Demand	17
2-16. Foundation for Evidence - Judicial Notice of Law and Facts	17
2-17. Foundation for Evidence - Method of Asking Court to Take Judicial Notice of a Fact	22
2-18. Foundation for Evidence - Judicial Notice of Testimony at Prior Pendente lite Hearing	22
2-19. Admissibility of Evidence - Settlement Offers Not Admissible	23
2-20. Admissibility of Evidence - Admissions and Letters by Party’s Attorney Admissible in Evidence	24
2-21. Admissibility of Evidence - Presumption that Only Admissible Evidence Was Considered By the Trial Court.	25
2-22. Admissibility of Evidence – Rule against Hearsay	25
2-23. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule against Hearsay Applicable in Matrimonial Case	27
2-24. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule against Hearsay - Verbal or operative acts and State of Mind	27
2-25. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule against Hearsay - State of Mind	27
2-26. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule against Hearsay - Present Sense Impression and Excited Utterance/Spontaneous Declaration	29
2-27. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule against Hearsay - Expressions of Intent	30

- 2-28. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule against Hearsay - Evidence of Abuse or Neglect in Custody and Child Protective Proceedings 30**
- 2-29. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule against Hearsay - Former Testimony 32**
- 2-30. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule against Hearsay - Admissions 32**
- 2-31. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule against Hearsay - Admission of New Spouse 33**
- 2-32. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule against Hearsay - Past recollection recorded 34**
- 2-33. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule against Hearsay - Business Records 34**
- 2-34. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule against Hearsay - Laying a Foundation for and Questions for Offering Business Records into Evidence 35**
- 2-35. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay - Business Records - Admission of Hospital bills and Records, Records and Reports of Genetic Marker or DNA tests, and Payment Records 37**
- 2-36. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule against Hearsay - Admission of Certified Hospital, Library, and Government Records. 38**
- 2-37. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay - Admission of Business Records - Other Certification Substitutes for Foundation Testimony. 39**
- 2-38. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay - Not Necessary to Lay Foundation For Admission of Certified Non-Party Business Records Produced Pursuant to Subpoena - CPLR 3122-a. 39**
- 2-39. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay - Admissibility of Medical Reports - Not admissible As Business Records Where They Contain Doctor's Opinion or Expert Proof 40**
- 2-40. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule against Hearsay - Laying a Foundation for Admission of Business Records and Records of Municipality into Evidence - Summary of Rule 41**
- 2-41. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule against Hearsay - Questions for Laying a Foundation for and Offering Business and Municipality Records into Evidence 42**
- 2-42. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule against Hearsay - Method of Laying a Foundation for and Offering into Evidence Certified Records of Business or Municipality 42**
- 2-43. Admissibility of Evidence - Exceptions to the Rule against Hearsay - Business Records Rule - Business Duty 42**

- 2-44. Admissibility of Evidence - Results of Lie Detector Test Inadmissible 43**
- 2-45. Admissibility of Evidence - Expert Report Inadmissible Without Consent
43**
- 2-46. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Testimony of One Spouse against the
Other. - Action founded Upon Adultery - In General 44**
- 2-47. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Testimony of One Spouse against the
Other- Action Founded Upon Adultery - As to Non-access 45**
- 2-48. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Testimony of One Spouse Against the
Other – Actions for Divorce, Separation or Annulment - Confidential
Communications. 45**
- 2-49. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Testimony of One Spouse against the
Other - Confidential Communications - Waiver 46**
- 2-50. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Confidential Communications - Waiver
46**
- 2-51. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Testimony of One Spouse for the
Other - Action founded Upon Adultery 47**
- 2-52. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Confessions and Admissions - Action
Founded Upon Adultery. 47**
- 2-53. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Conduct Prior to Marriage - Action
Founded Upon Adultery. 48**
- 2-54. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Attorney - Client Privilege - Civil
Practice Law and Rules § 4501. 48**
- 2-55. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Attorney-Client Communications May
Not Be Revealed To Court Absent Waiver 49**
- 2-56. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Psychologist - Patient Privilege - Civil
Practice Law and Rules § 4507. 49**
- 2-57. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Physician, dentist, podiatrist,
chiropractor and nurse Privilege - Civil Practice Law and Rules § 4507. 50**
- 2-58. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Clergy - Penitent Privilege - Civil
Practice Law and Rules § 4505. 51**
- 2-59. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Social worker - Patient Privilege - Civil
Practice Law and Rules § 4508(a). 51**
- 2-60. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Rape crisis counselor - client Privilege
- Civil Practice Law and Rules § 4510. 52**
- 2-61. Admissibility of Evidence - Practice Point - Privilege - Confidential
Communications 53**
- 2-62. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Fifth Amendment Privilege against
Self-Incrimination 53**
- 2-63. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Method of Making Objection to
Question on Fifth Amendment Grounds 55**

2-64. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Adverse Inference from Failure of Party to Testify and Failure to Call Favorable Witness - Missing Witness Rule in Civil Case	55
2-65. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - New York Privilege against Self-incrimination - Civil Practice Law and Rules §4501.	56
2-66. Admissibility of Evidence - Privilege - Electronic Communication of Privileged Communications - Civil Practice Law and Rules § 4548	56
2-67. Admissibility of Evidence - Evidence Illegally Obtained. – Unlawful Entry, Search and Seizure and Electronic Surveillance of Family Conversations – Exceptions for Custody and Article 10 Cases	57
2-68. Admissibility of Evidence - Suppression of Illegally Obtained Eavesdropping Evidence - Civil Practice Law and Rules § 4506(a) - Vicarious Consent for Child	59
2-69. Admissibility of Evidence - Motion to Suppress Illegally Obtained Eavesdropping Evidence under CPLR § 4506	60
2-70. Admissibility of Evidence - Illegal Interception of Electronic Evidence - Electronic Evidence Defined	61
2-71. Admissibility of Evidence - Social Networking Sites	64
2-72. Admissibility of Evidence - Admissibility of Electronic Evidence	65
2-73. Admissibility of Evidence - Authentication of Instant Message	67
2-74. Admissibility of Evidence - Authentication of Text Message and Questions for Introduction into Evidence	69
2-75. Questions to Lay Foundation for Introduction of text message into evidence	69
2-76. Admissibility of Evidence - Authentication of Blogs and Websites	70
2-77. Admissibility of Evidence - Authentication of email and Questions for Introduction	70
2-78. Questions to Lay Foundation for Introduction of email into evidence	71
2-79. Admissibility of Evidence - Evidence Obtained By Spyware - CPLR 4506	72
2-80. Admissibility of Evidence - Admissibility of Audio and Visual Recordings	73
2-81. Admissibility of Evidence - Admissibility of Audio and Visual Recordings - Foundation for Admission of Recordings	73
2-82. Admissibility of Evidence - Questions for Laying Foundation for Admission of Recorded telephone call into Evidence	76
2-83. Admissibility of Evidence - Questions for Laying Foundation for Admission of Transcript of Sound Recorded telephone call into Evidence	77
2-84. Admissibility of Evidence - Best evidence rule	78
2-85. Admissibility of Evidence - Parol Evidence Rule	80

2-86. Admissibility of Evidence - Spoliation - Unfavorable Inference - Preclusion	81
2-87. Admissibility of Evidence - Inadmissibility of Evidence Protected by the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act	82
2-88. Admissibility of Evidence - Admissibility of Foreign Language Exhibits and Affidavits and Papers	83
2-89. Admissibility of Evidence - Authentication of official record of court or government office in the United States	84
2-90. Admissibility of Evidence - Authentication of Foreign Records and Documents for Use at Trial	85
2-91. Practice Point - Effect of the Failure of a Party to Deny or Contradict Evidence or Pleadings	87
2-92. Practice Point - Effect of withholding Evidence in Your Possession, or Failure to Call a Witness	87
2-93. Practice Point – Testimony about Out of Court Statements Made by Third Party.	88
2-94. Practice Point - No Client - Expert Privilege.	88
2-95. Practice Point - Trial Evidence not Limited by Scope of Pretrial Disclosure	88
2-96. Practice Point - Admissibility of Charts and Summaries	89
Chapter 3. Conduct of Trial	90
3-1. Order of Trial - In General	90
3-2. Order of Trial - Opening and Closing statements: When and how to make them.	90
3-3. Order of Trial - Motion to Dismiss After Opening Statement	92
3-4. Conduct of Trial - Right to Call Witnesses for Direct Examination	93
3-5. Conduct of Trial - Right to Cross-Examination of Witness	95
3-6. Conduct of Trial - Scope of Cross-Examination - Making Adverse Witness Own Witness	97
3-7. Conduct of Trial - Redirect Examination	97
3-8. Conduct of Trial - Redirect Examination - Rule of Completeness	98
3-9. Conduct of Trial - Re-Cross Examination of Witness	99
3-10. Conduct of Trial - Motion to Dismiss for failure to establish a Prima Facie Case	99
3-11. Conduct of Trial - Rebuttal Evidence	100
3-12. Conduct of Trial - Courtroom Decorum for Counsel and Court - Addressing the Judge - Approaching the Bench.	101
3-13. Conduct of Trial - Calling a Witness to the Stand to Testify	102

- 3-14. Conduct of Trial - Method of Calling a Witness to the Stand - Presenting Witnesses 103**
- 3-15. Conduct of Trial - Requirement that Witness Have Personal Knowledge 103**
- 3-16. Conduct of Trial - Examination of Witnesses - Method of Examination - Improper Questions 103**
- 3-17. Conduct of Trial – Importance of Objections to Inadmissible Evidence or Improper Questions 104**
- 3-18. Conduct of Trial - Method of Making an Objection 106**
- 3-19. Conduct of Trial - Voir Dire to Challenge Foundation for Introduction of Evidence 106**
- 3-20. Conduct of Trial - Leading Questions - What they are and when they are permitted 107**
- 3-21. Conduct of Trial - Method of Making Objection to Leading Question 108**
- 3-22. Conduct of Trial - Refreshing the Witness’s Recollection 108**
- 3-23. Conduct of Trial - Questions for Refreshing Witness Recollection 109**
- 3-24. Conduct of Trial - Refreshing Recollection of Witness - Past recollection recorded 110**
- 3-25. Conduct of Trial - Motion for Reconsideration of Prior Ruling 110**
- 3-26. Conduct of Trial - Method of Making Motion to Reconsider Prior Ruling 110**
- 3-27. Conduct of Trial - Motion to Adjourn Trial - Defendant’s Objection to proceed with Defense before Plaintiff Rests 111**
- 3-28. Conduct of Trial - Method of Making Motion to Adjourn - Objection to proceed with Defense before Plaintiff Rests 111**
- 3-29. Conduct of Trial - Continuing Objection 111**
- 3-30. Conduct of Trial - Motion to Strike Evidence Improperly Admitted 112**
- 3-31. Conduct of Trial - Motion to Strike Evidence Admitted Subject to Connection 112**
- 3-32. Conduct of Trial - Offer of Proof - What is it? 112**
- 3-33. Conduct of Trial - Method of Making an Offer of Proof 113**
- 3-34. Conduct of Trial - Exclusion of Witnesses from Courtroom 113**
- 3-35. Conduct of Trial - Method of Making Request to Exclude Witnesses 113**
- 3-36. Conduct of Trial - Discretion of Judge to Question Witnesses 114**
- 3-37. Conduct of Trial - Right of Court to Compel Testimony 115**
- 3-39. Trial Testimony - Right to Confer with Counsel 118**
- 3-40. Trial Testimony - Right to Interpreter for Person Who Can Not Communicate with Court 118**
- 3-41. Trial Testimony - Calling the Adverse Party as a Witness 122**
- 3-42. Trial Testimony - Cross Examination - Modes of impeachment 123**

- 3-43. Trial Testimony - Cross - Examination - Impeachment of Witnesses 124**
- 3-44. Trial Testimony - Cross-Examination - Impeachment Limited by Collateral Evidence Rule 125**
- 3-45. Trial Testimony - Cross Examination - Impeachment - Reputation for Veracity 126**
- 3-46. Trial Testimony - Cross Examination - Reputation for Veracity - Laying Foundation for Impeachment Testimony of Bad Reputation for Veracity 126**
- 3-47. Trial Testimony - Cross Examination - Reputation for Veracity - Questions for Impeachment Testimony of Bad Reputation for Veracity 127**
- 3-48. Trial Testimony - Cross - Examination - Impeachment of Witness by Prior Inconsistent Statement and Questions for Introduction 127**
- 3-49. Trial Testimony- Cross - Examination – Inadmissibility of Proof of Prior Arrest, Indictment or Conviction for Petty Crime 129**
- 3-50. Trial Testimony - Cross - Examination - Attempt to Procure False Evidence Competent as an Admission 129**
- 3-51. Trial Testimony - Cross-Examination - Impeachment of Witness by Criminal Conviction 129**
- 3-52. Trial Testimony - Cross-Examination - Impeachment of Witness by Showing Bias, Hostility, or Interest 130**
- 3-53. Trial Testimony - Cross - Examination - Impeachment by Showing Witness Hostile to Party 130**
- 3-54. Trial Testimony- Cross - Examination - Impeachment by Showing Predisposition 130**
- 3-55. Trial Testimony - Questions for Impeaching Witness on Cross - Examination by Showing Hostility 130**
- 3-56. Trial Testimony - Impeaching own Witness 131**
- 3-57. Trial Testimony - Testimony of Child 131**
- 3-58. Trial Testimony - Prior Testimony - Use of Depositions at Trial or Hearing 132**
- 3-59. Trial Testimony - Prior Testimony - Use of Deposition from Prior Action 133**
- 3-60. Trial Testimony - Prior Testimony - Effect of using deposition. 133**
- 3-61. Trial Testimony - Prior Testimony - Use of Deposition Subject to Rules of Evidence 133**
- 3-62 Trial Testimony - Prior Testimony - Questions for Impeaching Witness on Cross Examination by Prior Deposition Testimony 134**
- 3-63. Trial Testimony - Prior Testimony - Use of Answers to Interrogatories 135**
- 3-64. Trial Testimony - Prior Testimony - Use of Answers to Interrogatories from Prior Action 136**

- 3-65. Trial Testimony - Prior Testimony - Effect of using Answers to Interrogatories. 136**
- 3-66. Trial Testimony - Prior Testimony - Use of Answers to interrogatories Subject to Rules of Evidence 136**
- 3-67. Trial Testimony - Prior Testimony - Questions for Impeaching Witness on Cross Examination by Answers to interrogatories 137**
- 3-68. Trial Testimony - Prior Testimony - Admission of Prior Testimony 138**
- 3-69. Trial Testimony - Prior Testimony - Admission of Prior Testimony Subject to Objection 139**
- 3-70. Trial Testimony - Prior Testimony - Necessity of Foundation for Admission of Prior Testimony 140**
- 3-71. Trial Testimony - Prior Testimony - Questions for Impeaching Witness on Cross Examination by Prior Testimony 141**
- 3-72. Trial Testimony - Method of Marking Documents as Exhibits for Identification and Offering them into Evidence 142**
- 3-73. Trial Testimony - Method of Offering Exhibit Marked for Identification into Evidence - Standard Questions 143**
-
- Chapter 4. Agreements and Stipulations of Settlement during Trial 144**
- 4-1. Stipulation of Settlement during Trial - Validity 144**
- 4-2. Separation Agreements - Validity - Public Policy - General Obligations Law §5-311 146**
- 4-3. Requirements for Child Support Agreements - Opting Out of the Child Support Standards Act 147**
- 4-4. Separation Agreements - Validity - Necessity for Parties to Be Separated or Immediate Separation Contemplated 149**
- 4-5. Separation Agreements - Abandonment by Reconciliation Renders Agreement Void 150**
- 4-6. Agreements - Incorporation into Judgment of Dissolution - Presumption of Survival or merger 151**
- 4-7. Practice Point - Method of Placing Stipulation on the Record 153**
- 4-8. Direct Examination - Allocution - Questions with regard to Agreement or Stipulation 153**
- 4-9. Direct Examination of Spouse - Questions to Establish Living Together after Signing Separation Agreement 154**
- 4-10. Direct Examination of Spouse - Questions to Establish Reconciliation after Signing Separation Agreement 154**
- 4-11. Direct Examination of Spouse - Questions to Establish to Establish Merger or Survival of Agreement into Divorce Judgment 155**

Part 2 Establishing Grounds for Divorce, Separation and Annulment and Defenses 156

Chapter 5. Presumptions, Burden of Proof and Proof of Marriage	156
5-1. In General - Presumptions and Burden of Proof	156
5-2. Presumptions and Burden of Proof as to Marriage	156
5-3. Presumption as To Continuance of Marriage.	157
5-4. Presumption as to Validity of Marriage	157
5-5. Burden of Going Forward to Prove Invalidity of Marriage	158
5-6. Presumption as to the validity of Marriage as Between Prior and Subsequent Marriages.	158
5-7. Presumption of Death of Former Spouse	159
5-8. Presumption as to Divorce	160
5-9. Proof of Marriage - In General	160
5-10. Proof of Marriage - Marriage Records and Other Documentary Evidence.	160
5-11. Proof of Marriage - Testimony of Parties	161
5-12. Proof of Marriage - Testimony of Third Persons	161
5-13. Proof of Marriage - Admissions and Declarations	161
5-14. Proof of Non-marriage	162
5-15. Overcoming Presumption of Validity of Marriage.	162
5-16. Overcoming Presumption of Validity of Marriage - Proof of Second Marriage	162
5-17. Proof of Common-Law Marriage	163
5-18. Proof of Foreign Marriage.	164
Chapter 6. Grounds for Divorce and Defenses	165
6-1. Cruel and Inhuman Treatment	165
6-2. Proof of Cruel and Inhuman Treatment	165
6-3. Defenses - Cruel and Inhuman Treatment	166
6-4. Abandonment	167
6-5. Proof of Abandonment	167
6-6. Actual Abandonment	168
6-7. Constructive Abandonment	168
6-8. Defenses: Abandonment	169
6-9. Defenses - Abandonment - Lack of Justification as an Element of the Cause of Action	169
6-10. Defenses - Abandonment - Reconciliation	170
6-11. Burden of Proof - Adultery	170
6-12. Definition of Adultery.	170

6-13. Proof of Adultery - In General	171
6-14. Proof of Adultery - By Circumstantial Evidence	171
6-15. Proof of Adultery By Testimony of Third Persons - Paramour, Prostitute, Private Detective - Rule of Corroboration in Uncontested Divorce Cases	173
6-16. Proof of Adultery by Proof of Divorce and Remarriage.	174
6-17. Proof of Adultery by Proof of Confessions - Rule of Corroboration	174
6-18. Defenses to Adultery - In General	175
6-19. Defenses to Adultery - Insanity as a Defense	175
6-20. Defenses to Adultery - Statute of Limitations	175
6-21. Defenses to Adultery - Affirmative Defense of Recrimination – (Adultery of the Plaintiff)	176
6-22. Defenses to Adultery - Affirmative Defense of Forgiveness (Condonation)	177
6-23. Defenses to Adultery - Proof of Forgiveness	177
6-24. Revival of Condoned Offense	178
6-25. Defenses to Adultery - Affirmative Defense of Connivance and Procurement	179
6-26. Defenses to Adultery - Collusion	179
6-27. Defenses to Adultery - Distinction between Collusion and Settlement	181
6-28. Burden of Proof - Imprisonment for Three Years	181
6-29. Proof of Confinement in Prison	181
6-30. Defenses - Imprisonment for Three Years - Statute of Limitations	182
6-31. Burden of Proof - Living Apart Pursuant to a Separation Judgment	182
6-32. Burden of Proof - Living Apart Pursuant to Separation Agreement	183
6-33. Burden of Proof - Proof of Living Separate	184
6-34. Irretrievable Breakdown for a Period of At Least 6 Months	184
6-35. Irretrievable Breakdown - Defined	185
6-36. Irretrievable Breakdown - Sufficiency of Proof and Defenses	185

Chapter 7. Action for a Divorce – Presumptions, Burden of Proof and Sufficiency of Evidence 188

7-1. Action for a Divorce - Burden of Proof and Sufficiency	188
7-2. Action for a Divorce - Burden of Proof and Sufficiency - In Case Defendant Defaults	188
7-3. Action for a Divorce - Burden of Proof and Sufficiency - Proof of Adultery	189
7-4. Action for a Divorce - Burden of Proof and Sufficiency - Proof of an Existing Valid Marriage.	189
7-5. Action for a Divorce - Burden of Proof and Sufficiency - Proof of Residence.	190

7-6. Action for a Divorce - Presumption of Legitimacy of Child of Marriage.	190
7-7. Action for a Divorce - Admissibility of Evidence and Competency of Witnesses - Action on the Ground of Adultery.	193

Chapter 8. Trial by Jury. 195

8-1. Right to Jury Trial	195
8-2. No Trial by Jury of Economic and Custody Issues	195
8-3. Waiver of Jury Trial.	196
8-4. Findings of Jury as Conclusive or Advisory.	196
8-5. Role of Trial Court	197
8-6. Selecting a Jury - Composition of Jury	197
8-7. Selecting a jury - Challenges generally	198
8-8. Selecting a jury - Peremptory challenges	198
8-9. Selecting a jury - Challenge for cause to the favor.	198
8-10. Selecting a jury - Challenge for cause: Disqualification of juror for relationship.	199
8-11. Request to Charge to the Jury	199
8-12. Charge to Jury -Testimony of Private Detective	199

Chapter 9. Direct Examination of Party or Witness - Questions to Establish a Prima Facie Case for a Divorce 201

9-1. Direct Examination of Party - Questions to Establish A Prima Facie Case for a Divorce - Cruel and Inhuman Treatment - Domestic Relations Law § 170(1)	201
9-2. Direct Examination of Party - Questions to Establish a Prima Facie Case for Divorce -Abandonment - Domestic Relations Law § 170(2)	202
9-3. Direct Examination of Party - Questions to Establish A Prima Facie Case for a Divorce - Abandonment - Constructive - Refusal to Have Sexual Relations- Domestic Relations Law §170(2)	203
9-4. Direct Examination of Party - Questions to Establish A Prima Facie Case for a Divorce - Confinement to Prison for Three Years - Domestic Relations Law §170(3)	204
9-5. Direct Examination of Party - Questions to Establish A Prima Facie Case for a Divorce - Adultery - Domestic Relations Law §170(4)	205
9-6. Questions to Private Investigator - Action for Divorce Based on Adultery	206
9-7. Questions to Nonparty Witness - Action for Divorce Based on Adultery	206
9-8. Direct Examination of Party - Questions to Establish A Prima Facie Case for a Divorce - Living apart Pursuant to a Judgment of Separation for More than one year- Domestic Relations Law § 170(5)	208

9-9. Direct Examination of Party - Questions to Establish A Prima Facie Case for a Divorce - Living apart Pursuant to an Agreement of Separation for More than one year- Domestic Relations Law § 170(6) 209

9-10. Questions for Examination of Witness to Offer Agreement into Evidence 210

9-11. Direct Examination of Party - Questions to Establish A Prima Facie Case for a Divorce on the Grounds of Irretrievable Breakdown- Domestic Relations Law § 170(7) 211

Chapter 10 – Grounds for Separation, Annulment and other Actions 213

10-1. Action for Separation 213

10-2. Action for an Annulment 213

10-3. Action for a Declaration of the Nullity of a Void Marriage - Incestuous and Bigamous Marriages 215

10-4. Action to Annul a Marriage for Incurable Mental Illness 216

10-5. Actions other than Actions for a Divorce in Which Ancillary Relief Available 216

10-6. Actions Other than for a Divorce in Which Equitable Distribution Available 216

10-7. Burden of Proof in Annulment Actions - Generally. 217

10-8. Burden of Proof in Annulment Actions - Physical Incapacity 217

10-9. Burden of Proof in Annulment Actions- Where Fraud is alleged as Ground. 217

10-10. Burden of Proof in Annulment Actions - Bigamous Marriages. 218

10-11. Burden of Proof in Annulment Action - In Case Defendant Defaults. 219

10-12. Burden of Proof in Declaratory Judgment Action - In Case Defendant Defaults. 219

10-13. Burden of Proof in Annulment Actions - Rule of Corroboration. 220

10-14. Burden of Proof in Annulment Action - Corroboration-Amount and Character of Corroboration. 221

Chapter 11. Direct Examination of Party or Witness - Questions to Establish a Prima Facie Case for Separation, Annulment, and Declaration of Nullity 223

11-1. Direct Examination of a Party - Questions to Establish a Prima Facie Case - Action for Separation - Actual Abandonment - Domestic Relations Law §200(2) 223

11-2. Direct Examination of a party - Questions to Establish a Prima Facie Case - Action for Separation - Constructive Abandonment [Lock out] - Domestic Relations Law §200(2) 223

- 11-3. Direct Examination Of Party - Questions to Establish A Prima Facie Case for a Separation - Abandonment - Constructive - Domestic Relations Law § 200(2) 224**
- 11-4. Direct Examination of a Party - Questions to Establish a Prima Facie Case - Action for Separation - Non-Support - Domestic Relations Law §200(3) 225**
- 11-6. Direct Examination of Party - Questions to Establish a Prima Facie Case - Action for Annulment - Declaration of Nullity of Void Marriage - Annulment of Bigamous Marriage - Domestic Relations Law §140(a) 227**
- 11-7. Direct Examination of Plaintiff - Questions to Establish a Prima Facie Case - Action for Annulment of Voidable Marriage - Party under Age of Consent - Domestic Relations Law §140(b) 229**
- 11-9. Direct Examination of Party - Questions to Establish a Prima Facie Case - Action for Annulment of Voidable Marriage - Consent By Force, Duress or Fraud - Fraud - Domestic Relations Law §140(e) 231**
- 11-10. Direct Examination of Party - Questions to Establish a Prima Facie Case - Action for Annulment of Voidable Marriage - Consent By Force, Duress or Fraud - Fraud - Misrepresentation as to having children - Domestic Relations Law §140(e) 232**
- 11-11. Direct Examination of Witness - Questions to Establish a Prima Facie Case - Action for Annulment of Voidable Marriage - Consent By Force, Duress or Fraud - Fraud - Misrepresentation as to having children - Domestic Relations Law §140(e) 234**
- 11-12. Direct Examination of Party - Questions to Establish a Prima Facie Case - Action for Annulment of Voidable Marriage - Consent By Force, Duress or Fraud - Fraud Misrepresentation of Paternity of a Child - Domestic Relations Law §140(e) 235**
- 11-13. Direct Examination of Party - Questions to Establish a Prima Facie Case - Action for Annulment of Voidable Marriage - Consent By Force, Duress or Fraud - Force or Duress - Domestic Relations Law §140(e) 237**
- 11-14. Direct Examination of Party - Questions to Establish a Prima Facie Case - Action for Annulment of Voidable Marriage - Incurable Mental Illness for Five Years - Domestic Relations Law §140(f) 238**

Part 3 – Obtaining Maintenance, Child Support, Exclusive Occupancy and Counsel Fees 240

Chapter 12. Direct Examination of Client – General Questions to Establish a Prima Facie Economic Case 240

12-1. Introductory Note, Requirement of Personal Knowledge and Background Information 240

12-2. Prior Marriages (Self)	242
12-3. History of Marriage (Self)	242
12-4. Children (Self)	243
12-5. Health, Education, Skills, Needs	244
12-6. Current residence (Self)	244
12-7. Assets (Self)	245
12-8. Business or Profession (Self)	249
12-9. Safe Deposit Box	250
22-10. Collections (Self)	250
12-11. Other Ventures (Self)	251
12-12. Other Assets (Self)	251
12-13. Assets (Spouse)	251
12-14. Business or Profession (Spouse)	256
12-15. Safe Deposit Box (Spouse)	257
12-16. Collections (Spouse)	257
12-17. Other Ventures (Spouse)	257
12-18. Other Assets (Spouse)	258
12-19. Marital Residence	258
12-20. Gross Income (Self)	258
12-21. Employment Benefits (Self)	259
12-22. Employment Contract/deferred Compensation (Self)	260
12-23. Other Income (Self)	260
12-24. Other Sources of Income	261
12-25. Royalty Income (Self)	261
12-26. Legal Settlements (Self)	262
12-27. Gambling, Award, Prize Income (Self)	262
12-28. Trusts (Self)	262
12-29. Guardian (Self)	262
12-30. Gross Income (Spouse)	263
12-31. Employment Benefits (Spouse)	263
12-32. Employment Contract/deferred Compensation (Spouse)	264
12-33. Other Income (Spouse)	264
12-34. Other Sources of Income (Spouse)	265
12-35. Royalty Income (Spouse)	266
12-36. Legal Settlements (Spouse)	266
12-37. Gambling, Award, Prize Income (Spouse)	266
12-38. Trusts (Spouse)	266
12-39. Guardian (Spouse)	267
12-40. Separate Property (Self)	267
12-41. Pre-separation Standard of Living	274

12-42. Contributions to Support (Self)	277
12-43. Liabilities (Self)	277
12-44. Accounts Payable (Self)	278
12-45. Notes Payable (Self)	278
12-46. Installment Accounts Payable (Security Agreements, Chattel Mortgages) (Self)	278
12-47. Brokers Margin Accounts (Self)	278
12-48. Mortgages Payable on Real Estate (Self)	279
12-49. Taxes Payable (Self)	279
12-50. Loans on Life Insurance Policies (Self)	279
12-51. Other Liabilities (Self)	280
12-52. Wage Deduction	280
12-53. Expenses	280
12-54. Contributions to Marital Property (Self)	283
12-55. Assets Transferred (Self)	284
12-56. Assets Transferred (Spouse)	284
12-57. Efforts to Obtain Employment (Self)	284
12-58. Interim Support Arrears and Violation of Automatic Orders (Self)	284
12-59. Need to Reside in Marital Home (Self)	288
12-60. Need for Education or Training and Plans for Future (Self)	288
12-61. Need for Childcare (Self)	288
12-62. Need for Nursery School, Private School, Religious School, College (Self)	288
12-63. Support Requests (Self)	289
12-64. Camp, Teen Tour, Summer Activities (Self):	289
12-65. Health Care for Child Not Covered by Insurance and Cash Medical Support (Self)	292
12-66. Counsel Fee Requirements (Self)	295
12-67. Accountant, Appraisal and Expert Fees (Self)	296

Chapter 13. Equitable Distribution Factors - Questions for Prima Facie Case
298

13-1. The Fourteen Equitable Distribution Factors - In General	298
13-2. The Fourteen Equitable Distribution Factors - Questions for Direct Examination of Client	298

Chapter 14. Cross - Examination of Spouse 305

14-1. Cross - Examination of Spouse Regarding Net Worth Affidavit	305
14-2. Questions for Cross Examination of Spouse - Does not remember	330
14-3. Questions for Cross Examination of Spouse - Gross Income	330

14-4. Questions for Cross Examination of Spouse - Expenses paid by Employer	
	332
14-5. Questions for Cross Examination of Spouse - Reimbursement by employer	
	334
14-6. Questions for Cross Examination of Spouse - Reimbursement by employer	
	334
14-7. Questions for Cross Examination of Spouse - Money for expenses, Breadwinner, Monied Spouse	336
14-8. Questions for Cross Examination of Spouse - Capital loss carry over	336
Chapter 15. Maintenance	339
15-1. Maintenance Awards – Actions Commenced Between July 19, 1980 and October 12, 2010 - Historical Perspective - Domestic Relations Law §236(B) (6) (a)	
	339
15-2. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards - Actions Commenced Between October 12, 2010, and January 22, 2016 – The 2010 Amendments to Domestic Relations Law § 236 [B] [6] [a]	341
15-3. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards - Actions Commenced Between October 12, 2010, and January 22, 2016 - Standard of Living during Marriage.	343
15-4. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards – Actions Commenced Between October 12, 2010, and January 22, 2016 - The Twenty Factors	343
15-5. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards - Actions Commenced Between October 12, 2010, and January 22, 2016 - Duration of Maintenance	351
15-6. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards - Actions Commenced Between October 12, 2010, and January 22, 2016 - Imputed Income	352
15-7. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards - Actions Commenced Between October 12, 2010, and January 22, 2016 - Effect of McSparron and Grunfeld Cases	356
15-8. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards - Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016 - In General	357
15-9. Post-Divorce Maintenance Guidelines in Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016 – Definitions – Income Cap	360
15-10. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards -Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016 – Mandatory Application	361
15-11. Post-Divorce Maintenance Guidelines in Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016 - Determine the Income of the Parties – Inclusions in Income	362
15-12. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards - Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016 –Determine the Income of the Parties--Deductions from Income	364

15-13. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards - Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016 - Calculation of the Post - Divorce Maintenance Guideline Amount	365
15-14. Post-Divorce Maintenance Guidelines - Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016 - Self-Support Reserve	367
15-15. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards - Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016 - Divorce Maintenance Guideline Obligation Award Unless Unjust or Inappropriate	368
15-16. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards - Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016 - The Fifteen Factors in Domestic Relations Law § 236[B] [6] [e] [1]	369
15-17. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards - Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016 - Required Statement of Factors and Reasons	370
15-18. Post -Divorce Maintenance Awards - Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016 - Duration of Post-Divorce Maintenance and Retirement Factor	371
15-19. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards - Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016 - Retroactivity of Maintenance Awards	372
15-20. Post-divorce Maintenance Awards - Effect of a Barrier to Remarriage - Domestic Relations Law §236 (B) (6) (o).	373
15-21. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards - Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016 -Unrepresented Parties	376
15-22. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards - Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016 - Opting Out of Domestic Relations Law §236[B] [6]	376
15-23. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards - Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016 - Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards - Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016 -In Case of Default or Where Insufficient Evidence	376
15-24. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards - Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016 -Effect of Guidelines upon Modification of Post-Divorce Maintenance	376
15-25. Post-Divorce Maintenance Awards - Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016 -Termination of Post-Divorce Maintenance	377
15-26. Special Relief - In General	377
15-27. Special Relief - Life Insurance	378
15-28. Special Relief - Health Insurance	380
Chapter 16. Post - Divorce Maintenance Awards - Domestic Relations Law § 236[B] [6] - Questions for Prima Facie Case	381

16-1. Direct Examination of client - Questions to Establish Prima Facie Case for Maintenance - Actions commenced on or after October 12, 2010 until January 23, 2016.	381
16-2. Direct Examination of client in actions commenced on or after October 12, 2010, until January 23, 2016 - Gross Income and Additions	382
16-3. Direct Examination of Client - Actions commenced on or after October 12, 2010, until January 23, 2016 - Self-employment Deductions	383
16-4. Direct Examination of Client - Actions commenced on or after October 12, 2010, until January 23, 2016 - Imputed income	383
16-5. Direct Examination of Client - Actions commenced on or after October 12, 2010, until January 23, 2016 - Reduced resources or income	384
16-6. Direct Examination of Client - Actions commenced on or after October 12, 2010, until January 23, 2016 - Deductions from income	385
16-7. Direct Examination of Client - Actions commenced on or after October 12, 2010, until January 23, 2016 - Standard of living of the parties established during the marriage	386
16-8. Direct Examination of Client - Actions commenced on or after October 12, 2010, until January 23, 2016 - The Twenty Factors for Maintenance	389
16-9. Direct Examination of Client - Actions commenced on or after October 12, 2010, until January 23, 2016 - Effect of a barrier to remarriage - Domestic Relations Law §253 (6).	398
16-10. Post-divorce Maintenance Guidelines Awards. - Questions to Establish Prima Facie Case for Maintenance - Actions commenced on or after January 23, 2016 - In General	398
16-11. Direct Examination of Client - Actions commenced on or after January 23, 2016 - Gross Income and Additions	398
16-12. Direct Examination of Client - Actions commenced on or after January 23, 2016 -Self-employment Deductions	400
16-13. Direct Examination of Client - Actions commenced on or after January 23, 2016 -Imputed income	401
16-14. Direct Examination of Client - Actions commenced on or after January 23, 2016 -Reduced resources or income	402
16-15. Direct Examination of Client - Actions commenced on or after January 23, 2016 -Deductions from income	402
16-16. Direct Examination of Client - Actions commenced on or after January 23, 2016 - Post - divorce Maintenance Guideline Amount Calculation	404
16-17. Direct Examination of Client - Actions commenced on or after January 23, 2016 - Post - divorce Maintenance Guideline Obligation – Questions for Anticipated retirement	417

16-18. Post - Divorce Maintenance Guidelines Obligation - Actions commenced on or after January 23, 2016 - Duration of Post-Divorce Maintenance	418
16-19. Direct Examination of Client - Actions commenced on or after January 23, 2016 - Self-Support Reserve	418
16-20. Direct Examination of Client - Actions commenced on or after January 23, 2016 - Effect of a barrier to remarriage - Domestic Relations Law §253 (6)	419
Chapter 17. Examination of Employment Recruiter	420
17-1. Direct Examination of Employment Recruiter	420
Chapter 18. Examination of Employer	422
18-1. Direct Examination of Employer – Compensation and Bonus	422
18-2. Direct Examination of Employer - Stock Options	424
18-3. Direct Examination of Employer - Profit Sharing or Pension Plan	427
18-4. Direct Examination of Employer - Deferred Compensation Plan	431
18-5. Direct Examination of Employer - Reimbursement for Business Expenses, Credit Card Use, and Air Miles	431
18-6. Direct Examination of Employer - Accumulated Sick Days	433
18-7. Direct Examination of Employer - Accumulated Vacation Days	434
18-8. Direct Examination of Employer - Investment or Savings Plan	435
18-9. Direct Examination of Employer - Medical and Other Benefits	436
Chapter 19. Child Support	438
19-1. Child Support - Presumption that Basic Child Support Obligation is Correct Amount of Support	438
19-2. Definition of Income - Determine Combined Parental Income	446
19-3. Definition of Income - Income Defined	446
19-4. Definition of Income - Investment income	448
19-5. Definition of Income – Income from Other Sources and Voluntarily Deferred Income	448
19-6. Definition of Income - “Imputed income”	449
19-7. Definition of Income - Additions to Gross (total) income in actions commenced on or after January 24, 2016	452
19-8. Definition of Income - Additions to Income	454
19-9. Definition of Income - Deductions from Income	454
19-10. Child Support - Non-Custodial Parent in Joint and Shared custody situations	455
19-11. Add-ons - Child Care - Domestic Relations Law §240(1-b) (c) (4) and Domestic Relations Law §240(1-b) (c) (6).	457

- 19-12. Add-ons - Health Care Not Covered by Insurance - Domestic Relations Law 240(1-b) (c) (5) - Cash Medical Support 457**
- 19-13. Add-ons - Education Expenses - Domestic Relations Law §240(1-b) (c) (6) 459**
- 19-14. Child Support - Determining How Much Income to Apply Statutory Percentage to Where Combined Parental Income is in Excess of the Statutory income cap 460**
- 19-15. Child Support - Based on Actual Need in High-Income Cases 461**
- 19-16. Child Support - Effect of insufficient evidence to determine gross income 462**
- 19-17. Child Support - Self-Support Reserve 462**

Chapter 20. Child Support - Domestic Relations Law §240 (1-b) - Questions for Prima Facie Case 464

- 20-1. Child Support - In General 464**
- 20-2. Direct Examination of Client - Gross Income and Additional Income 465**
- 20-3. Direct Examination of Client - Self-employment Deductions 467**
- 20-4. Direct Examination of Client - Imputed income 467**
- 20-5. Direct Examination of Client - Reduced resources or income 468**
- 20-6. Direct Examination of Client - Deductions from income 469**
- 20-7. Direct Examination of Client - Non-recurring payments from Extraordinary Sources 470**
- 20-8. Basic Child Support Obligation - Unjust or Inappropriate - In General 472**
- 20-9. Direct Examination of Client - Unjust or Inappropriate Factors 472**
- 20-10. Direct Examination of Client - Add-on for Child Care for work or education that will lead to employment 476**
- 20-11. Direct Examination of Client - Add-on for Cost of Childcare for seeking work 476**
- 20-12. Direct Examination of Client - Add-on for Cost of Post-secondary, private, special or enriched education. 477**
- 20-13. Direct Examination of Client - Add-on for Health Care Not Covered by Insurance and Cash Medical Support 478**
- 20-14. Direct Examination of Client – Self-Support Reserve 483**

Chapter 21. Exclusive Occupancy of Marital Residence 485

- 21-1. Exclusive Occupancy of Marital Home - Burden of Proof - Domestic Relations Law § 234 485**

Chapter 22. Exclusive Occupancy of the Martial Residence - Questions for Prima Facie Case 488

22-1. Direct Examination of Client This chapter contains questions which supplement the general questions to establish a prima facie economic case in chapter 12. These questions should be asked if necessary to suit your clients' request for exclusive occupancy. **Authors note:** Several of the questions in this chapter and the chapters that follow contain words or phrases in brackets or parenthesis. Several of the questions contain parenthesis or brackets separating the parts of the question or the person to whom a question may apply (i.e., [Plaintiff] [Defendant]). There are also questions written as singular and plural questions, (i.e., child (ren)) and (If yes) and (If no) questions which refer to whether the previous question was answered in the affirmative or negative. All or part of a question may or may not be applicable in your case. If so, counsel should use the portion(s) of the question that is (are) applicable in the particular case, rather than ask the question as written. In many instances, it may be necessary to repeat portions of a question or series of questions several times, each time using a different part of the question, or series of questions. If the client has personal knowledge of his or her spouses' circumstances the same questions which the client is asked about himself or herself may be asked with regard to the clients' spouse. Many of the same questions may be asked of the client's spouse on cross-examination, or on direct examination if you call the spouse as a witness on your direct case. 488

Chapter 23. Counsel Fee Awards	490
23-1. Counsel Fee Awards - In General	490
23-2. Counsel Fee Awards - Actions Commenced On or After October 10, 2010	494
23-3. Counsel Fee Awards - Actions Commenced On or After October 10, 2010 - Domestic Relations Law §237(a) and (d)	495
23-4. Counsel Fee Awards - Actions Commenced On or After October 10, 2010 - Relevant Case Law – No Counsel fees to Monied Spouse – Sanctions	496
23-5. Counsel Fee Awards - Right to a Hearing	497
23-6. Counsel Fee Awards - Time for Application	497
23-7. Counsel Fee Awards - Effect of Rules of Professional Conduct	498
23-8. Counsel Fee Awards - Expert Fees	499
Chapter 24. Counsel Fee Awards - Questions for Prima Facie Case	502
24-1. Direct Examination of Trial Counsel	502
24-2. Direct Examination of Law Firm Bookkeeper	509

Part 4 Property Distribution and Evidence of Value 511

Chapter 25. Property Distribution	511
--	------------

25-1. “Property” Redefined - “Marital Property” Defined – Tracing Property to its Source as Marital Property	511
25-2 Equitable Distribution - Professional Degrees and Licenses	515
25-3. Domestic Relations Law §236[B] [5] [d] [7] - Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016 - The Demise of O'Brien	515
25-4. Equitable Distribution - Appreciation of Separate Property Is Marital Property	517
25-5. Separate Property Defined - Domestic Relations Law § 236 [B] (1) (d)	518
25-6. Separate Property - Property Acquired Before Marriage or By Inheritance or Gift	518
25-7. Separate Property - Compensation for Personal Injury	519
25-8. Separate Property - Property Acquired in Exchange for Separate Property	519
25-9. Separate Property - Property Described in Agreement as Separate Property	520
25-10. Distributive Award Defined - Domestic Relations Law § 236 [B] [5] [e]	520
25-11. Presumptions - Marital and Separate Property	521
25-12. Burden of Proof - Value - Effect of Failure to Value	522
25-13. Property Distribution – Allocation of Marital Assets and Marital Debts – In Kind Distribution	526
25-14. Property Distribution - Appreciation of Separate Property - Burden of Proof - Direct and Indirect Contributions	528
25-15. Property Distribution – Value of Homemaker Services.	529
25-16. Property Distribution - Separate Property - Burden of Proof Property Is Separate	530
25-17. Property Distribution - Separate Property Becomes Marital Property - Commingling - Source of the Funds	532
25-18. Property Distribution - Reducing Enhanced Earnings by Amount of Distributive Award – Actions Commenced on or after January 23, 2016	536
25-19. Property Distribution - Reducing Enhanced Earnings by Amount of Distributive Award – Exception to Rule for tangible income-producing asset	538
25-20. Property Distribution - Valuation Date	539
25-21. Property Distribution - Retirement Benefits, Severance Payments, Stock Plans, Bonuses and Deferred Compensation	540
25-22. Property Distribution - Burden of Proof -The Fourteen Factors - Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d)	549
25-23. Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d) - The Fourteen Factors - Factor (1)	550
25-24. Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d) - The Fourteen Factors - Factor (2)	551

- 25-25. Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d) - The Fourteen Factors - Factor (3) 551**
- 25-26. Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d) - The Fourteen Factors - Factor (4) 552**
- 25-27. Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d) - The Fourteen Factors - Factor (5) 552**
- 25-28. Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d) - The Fourteen Factors - Factor (6) 553**
- 25-29. Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d) - The Fourteen Factors - Factor (7) 553**
- 25-30. Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d) - The Fourteen Factors - Factor (8) 554**
- 25-31. Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d) - The Fourteen Factors - Factor (9) 555**
- 25-32. Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d) - The Fourteen Factors - Factor (10) 555**
- 25-33. Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d) - The Fourteen Factors - Factor (11) 556**
- 25-34. Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d) - The Fourteen Factors - Factor (12) 556**
- 25-35. Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d) - The Fourteen Factors - Factor (13) 558**
- 25-36. Domestic Relations Law § 236 (B) (5) (d) - The Fourteen Factors - Factor (14) 558**
- 25-37. Property Distribution - Effect of Barrier to Remarriage -Domestic Relations Law §236(B) (5) (h) 559**

Chapter 26. Opinion Evidence and Need for Expert Testimony 562

- 26-1. Opinion Evidence - Opinion of Ordinary Witness as to ownership, intent, belief and value of property or services. 562**
- 26-2. Opinion Evidence - Admissibility of Expert Testimony - Basis for Admission of Expert Opinion 564**
- 26-3. Opinion Evidence – Qualification of Expert and Weight of Testimony 568**
- 26-4. Opinion Evidence - Expert Cannot Be Compelled to Testify 569**
- 26-5. Opinion Evidence - Form of expert opinion 570**
- 26-6. Opinion Evidence - Cross Examination of Expert Witnesses - Impeaching the Expert 573**
- 26-7. Opinion Evidence - Impeaching Your Own Expert Witness. 573**

Chapter 27. Valuation Methodology 575

27-1. Valuation Methodology - Generally	575
27-2. Value of Real Property and Marital Residence.	575
27-3. Value of Homemaker Services	576
Chapter 28. Proof of Value of Personal Property	578
28-1. Value of Personal Property	578
28-2. Value of Personal Property - Market reports - CPLR 4533	578
28-3. Value of Personal Property - Use of Statistical Tables	578
Chapter 29. Valuation of a Business, Corporation or Partnership	580
29-1. Valuation of a Business, Corporation or Partnership - Recognized Valuation Concepts-Rev Rul 59-60 - Amodio	580
29-2. Valuation of a Business, Corporation or Partnership - Recognized Valuation Concepts - Capitalization of Earnings Method.	582
29-3. Valuation of a Business, Corporation or Partnership - Recognized Valuation Concepts - Capitalization of Dividends Method.	586
29-4. Valuation of a Business, Corporation or Partnership - Recognized Valuation Concepts - Liquidation Method.	587
29-5. Valuation of a Business, Corporation or Partnership - Recognized Valuation Concepts - Adjusted Book Value Method.	587
29-6. Valuation of a Business, Corporation or Partnership - Recognized Valuation Concepts - Excess Earnings (Formula) Method	588
29-7. Valuation Methodology - Value to Owner Method	590
Chapter 30. Valuation of Professional Degrees, Licenses and Academic Degrees	591
30-1. Valuation Methodology - Professional Degrees, Licenses, and Academic Degrees – The Testimony in the O’Brien Case	591
30-2. Valuation and Distribution of a Professional License	594
30-3. Valuation Date - Active Assets and Passive Assets	594
30-4. Post Commencement Events May Be Considered	595
30-5. Valuation and Distribution of a Professional License, Professional Practice and Maintenance Award – Demise of O’Brien	595
Chapter 31. Methodology of Valuation of Law Practice	596
31-1. Valuation of Law Practice	596
Chapter 32. Methodology of Pension Valuation	600
32-1. Pension Valuation	600

Chapter 33. Methodology of Real-Estate Valuation	612
33-1. Market Value	612
33-2. Three Approaches to Value.	614
33-3. Highest and Best Use.	614
33-4. Land Value.	615
33-5. Application of the Three Approaches.	616
33-6. Sales Comparison Approach.	616
33-7. Cost Approach.	617
33-8. Income Capitalization Approach.	617
33-9. Reconciliation of Value Indications.	618
Chapter 34. Examination of Real Estate Appraiser	619
34-1. Direct Examination - Qualification as Expert	619
34-2. Direct Examination of Real Estate Appraiser - Valuation of Real Estate	620
34-3. Direct Examination of Real Estate Appraiser - Annotated	623
34-4. Cross-Examination of Real Estate Appraiser	626
Chapter 35. Examination of Accountant - Valuation of Close Corporation	630
35-1. Direct Examination of Accountant - Qualification as Expert	630
35-2. Direct Examination - Valuation of Corporation	631
Chapter 36 Examination of Pension Expert	635
36-1. Direct Examination - Qualification as Expert	635
36-2. Direct Examination - Valuation of Pension	636
Part 5 Trial of a Custody Case	638
Chapter 37. Jurisdiction to Determine Custody or Visitation	638
37-1. Custody Jurisdiction - In General	638
37-2. Initial Child Custody Jurisdiction	639
37-3. Continuing Jurisdiction of Original Decree State	640
37-4. Jurisdiction for Modification of Child Custody Determination of Court of another State	641
37-5. Preemption of Jurisdiction by Parental Kidnapping Prevention Act of 1980	641
37-6. Information to be submitted to court - Domestic Relations Law § 76-h	642
Chapter 38. Custody Litigation	644
38-1. Custody Proceedings – Custody, Joint custody and Visitation Defined	644
38-2. Custody Proceedings - Presumption in favor of visitation	645

38-3. Custody Proceedings - Zones of Decision Making	646
38-4. Custody Proceedings - Role of the Court - CPLR 4213 (b)	647
38-5. Custody Proceedings - Burden of Proof - Best Interests of the Child	648
38-6. Custody Proceedings - Burden of Proof - Effect of Domestic violence	648
38-7. Custody Proceedings - Presumption as to custody	648
38-8. Custody Proceedings - Totality of the circumstances - Factors Considered	648
38-9. Factors Considered - Availability and ability of the Parents	653
38-10. Factors Considered - Interference with the relationship between child and non-custodial parent	654
38-11. Factors Considered - "Friendly parent" concept	654
38-12. Factors Considered - Psychological factors and Expert Opinions	657
38-13. Factors Considered - Home environment, material resources and logistics	658
38-14. Factors Considered - Continuity of stable environment	658
38-15. Factors Considered - Child's preference	658
38-16. Factors Considered - Keeping siblings together	659
38-17. Factors Considered - Parents Lifestyle, sexual orientation	660
38-18. Factors Considered - Primary caretaker	660
38-19. Factors Considered - Economic Status	660
38-20. Factors Considered - Child Care Arrangements	661
38-21. Factors Considered - Parental Lifestyle and Religion.	661
38-22. Factors Considered - Illicit Sex	661
38-23. Factors Considered - Abandonment of the Child	662
38-24. Factors Considered - Mental Illness of a Parent	662
38-25. Custody Proceedings - Evidence - Admissibility of Hearsay	662
38-26. Custody Proceedings - Evidence - Use of Experts, Evaluations, and Reports	663
38-27. Custody Proceedings - Evidence - Investigations	668
38-28. Custody Proceedings – Evidence - In-camera and Lincoln interviews	668
38-29. Custody Proceedings – Evidence - Confidential communications - Waiver in Custody Cases	670
38-30. Custody Proceedings - Evidence - Child Permitted to Assert Psychologist - Patient Privilege	671
38-31. Custody Proceedings - Evidence - Admissibility of child abuse reports	672
38-32. Custody Proceedings - Evidence - Child as a Witness	673

Chapter 39. Psychological Tests, Guidelines for Child Custody Evaluations and The Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders 674

- 39-1. Psychological Testing - In General 674**
- 39-2. Parenting Assessment Tests 676**
- 39-3. Intelligence Tests 676**
- 39-4. Academic tests 678**
- 39-5. Neuropsychological tests 679**
- 39-6. Personality tests 679**
- 39-7. Rating scales and inventories 682**
- 39-8. Story-telling tests 682**
- 39-9. Sentence-completion tests 683**
- 39-10. Projective drawings 683**
- 39-11. Other assessment methods 683**
- 39-12. Impeachment of Forensic - In General 683**
- 39-13. Impeachment of Forensic Expert - Authoritative Scientific Texts - Guidelines for Child Custody Evaluations 685**
- 39-14. The Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (DSM-V) 686**
- 39-15. The Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders - Definition of Mental Disorder - Caution for Use of DSM-V in a Forensic Setting 687**

Chapter 40. Direct Examination of Party - Prima Facie Custody Case 689

- 40-1. Custody Jurisdiction 689**
- 40-2. Children 691**
- 40-3. History 692**
- 40-4. Upbringing of child 692**
- 40-5. Living accommodations 694**
- 40-6. Employment 694**
- 40-7. School 694**
- 40-8. Grandparents and relatives 695**
- 40-9. Typical day 695**
- 40-10. Child's friends 696**
- 40-11. Religion, drug and medical 696**
- 40-12. Daycare, babysitter 696**
- 40-13. Other relationships 696**
- 40-14. Interim background and pendente lite order and visitation 697**
- 40-15. Inappropriate behavior/domestic violence 698**
- 40-16. Love your child 698**

Chapter 41. Examination of Psychiatrist and Psychologist 699

- 41-1. Direct Examination of Psychiatrist - Qualification as Expert 699**

41-2. Direct Examination of Psychologist - Qualification as Expert	702
41-3. Questions for Direct Examination of Psychiatrist Appointed By Court	705
41-4. Questions for Direct Examination of Court Appointed Psychologist	708
Chapter 42. Cross examination of Psychiatrist and Psychologist	711
42-1. Questions for Cross Examination of Psychiatrist or Psychologist	711
42-2. Cross Examination of Court Appointed Psychiatrist Who Recommends Custody to Father	716
42-2 Cross Examination of Court Appointed Psychiatrist or Psychologist Regarding MMPI-2 Testing	726
42-3 Cross Examination of Psychologist - Failure to Follow APA Guidelines	732
Chapter 43. Redirect Examination of Psychiatrist	735
43-1 Redirect Examination of Court appointed psychiatrist	735
43-2 Redirect Examination of Psychiatrist for Mother	735